

# PLAN COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, November 18, 2015

**Present:** Cindy Wermuth (Chairman), Mike Crotty, Dan McConaghy, John Wetzel, Jeff Nelson, Butch Trevor, Matt Puck, Dennis Kelly

**Absent:** Bill Fitzsimmons (Vice Chairman), Brandy Howe, Pete McDermott

**Staff:** Shawn Christ, Maureen Riggs, Ray Forsythe, Anamaria Vera

**Others:** David Smith, Dan Wolff, Jeff R. Heuer

## 1. Swearing in of persons to give testimony

Shawn Christ swore in the persons who wished to provide testimony.

## 2. Open Public Hearing

Chairman Wermuth opened the Public Hearing for PC 15-09, PC 15-10, PC 15-11 and combined the applications for PC 15-09 and PC 15-10.

## 3. PC 15-09: Public hearing to consider a request from S.J. Russell, L.C. for a preliminary and final Planned Unit Development (PUD) Plan for senior living community to be located at 635 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue and PC 15-10: Public hearing to consider a request from S.J. Russell, L.C. for a Special Use Permit for a group development located at 635 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue. *(Shawn Christ, Land Development Manager)*

Shawn Christ noted that the current hearing is a continuation of the first hearing held on October 28, 2015, stating that the applicant has returned with revised plans. Mr. Christ highlighted the change of a "U" shape to an "L" shape of the building in the plans; the building was also shifted north, made longer on the west side, and shows underground parking on the west wing. Mr. Christ stated that in addition to the current changes, the applicant is contemplating additional improvements. Mr. Christ presented the revised plans and elevation drawings to the Commission. Commissioner Wetzel sought clarification on the east elevation. Commissioner Kelly stated he believed the elevations were not properly labeled. Mr. Christ noted that the Developer would have the opportunity to explain the revised plans and elevations following his presentation.

Mr. Christ stated that there were notable issues within the plans; he further stated that the Developer would like the lot size to remain 15.8 acres in order to have the option to return with a final P.U.D. and develop in the future. Mr. Christ also noted that the landscaping must exceed the ordinance, and highlighted that traffic studies for other similar projects showed less than a 1% traffic increase. Mr. Christ stated that as a result of the traffic studies, he does not see a need for a 4-way traffic stop, light or an alternative entrance, further stating that Scott Hinton, City Engineer, advised that the proposed entrance was not ideal but also did not see any other location to access the lot. Mr. Christ restated staff's desire to incorporate the 4<sup>th</sup> Street stairway due to lack of connectivity, however, Mr. Christ noted that the Developer did not have the desire to maintain the stairway. Mr. Christ moved on to the 6<sup>th</sup> Street streetscape, stating that the One Moline Place was supposed to maintain the streetscape but

was unable to. Mr. Christ stated that the Developer was willing to share the responsibility of maintaining the 6<sup>th</sup> Street streetscape, but did not want to take full responsibility of it.

Staff recommends approval for a preliminary and final Planned Unit Development Plan and for a Special Use Permit with three conditions:

1. The site plan revised to clarify the location of the outdoor common patio;
2. The 4<sup>th</sup> street stairway repaired and incorporated into the projects walking path; and
3. The developer to accept responsibility for future maintenance of any streetscaping enhancements to remain along their property frontage.

Commissioner Kelly requested clarification as to the use of the 4<sup>th</sup> Street stairway. Commissioner Nelson stated that the stairway is used by kids who walk to Lincoln Irving Elementary School from the Florecente neighborhood. Commissioner Wetzel inquired if the continued use of the stairway following the development would constitute trespassing; noting that connectivity requirements have been made in the past with easements but he is of the belief that an open stairway would create conflicts. Chairman Wermuth stated she recalled the Developer had plans to install a fence. Commissioner Crotty noted that in addition to maintenance, the Commission should also take into consideration snow removal, general clean-up, and liability issues. Commissioner Nelson stated that the request is similar to streetscape. Commissioner McConaghy sought clarification as to whether it would be the owner's responsibility to control access to the stairway. Mr. Christ confirmed it would be the owner's responsibility to control access to the stairway, noting that the stairway is currently in use. Mr. Christ stated that if the stairway is removed, there will be no access from 4<sup>th</sup> Street to 6<sup>th</sup> Street.

David Smith of S.J. Russell addressed the Commission and stated the plans have changed for the better. Mr. Smith noted that the "L" shape and single story memory care will give the building a cascading effect and also allows greater distance for egress and ingress. Mr. Smith further noted the building was also expanded to include mechanical rooms and waste removal, eliminating those services from street view. Mr. Smith stated that the landscaping for the site is set to meet the ordinance; however, he will continue to work with the landscaping architect. Mr. Smith elaborated upon the traffic study mentioned by Mr. Christ, noting that the study was conducted at two locations, one with 116 units and another with 100 units. Both locations were all independent living and resulted in a traffic count of 15 cars per day, whereas the proposed development would be a combination of independent, assisted, and memory care units. Mr. Smith also noted a walking path would be created around the building, and as a result, there is a concern with allowing the general public to have access to the back of the building. Mr. Smith stated it is their desire to limit access to the building to the main entrance, emphasizing their lack of interest to maintain the stairway. Mr. Smith went on to describe plans to create retention ponds and the desire to incorporate a monumental nature streetscape of some sort. Mr. Smith noted that S.J. Russell understands that any amendments to the plans will require additional approval in the future and apologized for the type-o and confusion on the elevation drawings.

Chairman Wermuth inquired as to the plans for the steps. Mr. Smith stated that their intention is to either completely remove the stairway or enclose the stairway with fencing and post private property signs to prevent access. Commissioner Kelly asked whether any renderings of the development would be available in the future. Mr. Smith stated that a 3D rendering that rotates would be made. Commissioner McConaghy asked what design theme would be followed for the undeveloped side of the PUD. Mr. Smith stated that the plan is to continue to utilize the same color scheme throughout with

similar materials and color palettes to give a “campus” feel. Commissioner McConaghy noted he was pleased with the proposed development and further noted his desire to see retention ponds. Mr. Smith stated that plans to create spill ways to catch water and contain it with similar stonework will be incorporated due to problems with erosion. Commissioner Wetzel stated he believed it would be ideal to incorporate a clinic or hospital. Mr. Smith stated UnityPoint is interested in having a presence in this project.

**4. PC 15-11: Public hearing to consider an application from Dan Wolff for a final Planned Unit Development Plan for a car wash to be located in the 6001 block of 44<sup>th</sup> Avenue. (*Shawn Christ, Land Development Manager*)**

Shawn Christ stated that PC 15-11 is an application from Dan Wolff for a final Planned Unit Development for a carwash to be located in the northeast corner of 60<sup>th</sup> Street and 41<sup>st</sup> Avenue, a 1.5 acre lot zoned D-3, owned by Menards, Inc. within Valley View Village. Mr. Christ noted the lot is surrounded by commercial and vacant lots, further noting the area was originally proposed as an upscale commercial area, however, that plan has since evolved. Mr. Christ stated the plan meets the landscaping requirements and does not display much signage. Mr. Christ stated the following issues: (1) exterior building materials are specific within the code and the proposed materials do not meet the code, however, the proposed vinyl works well for the intended business use, further, the preliminary PUD states that there must be harmony among the buildings; (2) the specific location within the preliminary PUD called for restaurants, small retail, or a hotel on lot 3, as a result, staff is concerned the original intent of the lot will be lost; and (3) site is designed to connect the driveway to the existing lot, however, there will not be any connectivity. Mr. Christ states that the proposal is deficient in materials and dissimilar from the other buildings at Valley View Village.

Staff recommends denial.

Commissioner Kelly suggested that maybe the south side is a better location for the carwash and inquires as to whether the applicant would be able to meet the other requirements of the PUD on the south side. Mr. Christ states that the south side is not as visible and may resolve the location concern.

Brief discussion ensues with regard to shared drive and access to lot 3.

Dan Wolff from Dubuque, IA stated that he currently operates three carwashes in the Quad Cities, one on Avenue of the Cities in Moline, one on 53<sup>rd</sup> Avenue in Davenport and one on Devil’s Glenn Road in Bettendorf. Mr. Wolff noted that he has been working with Menards since May, further noting the cost of the lot is high and will still require infrastructure and utilities without any assistance from Menards. Mr. Wolff stated his business is location sensitive and he likes the car count at the proposed location. Mr. Wolff also noted he cannot be located in the middle because there is no access. Mr. Wolff stated that the proposed building is identical to his other locations and stated that his business utilizes “cookie cutter” buildings with vinyl material due to their resistance to being wet all the time. The material is also maintenance free. Mr. Wolff also explained that the exterior building shown will be combustibles outside of the boiler room.

Commissioner Kelly asked whether the south side has been considered. Mr. Wolff stated that due to the sensitivity of location, he is not interested in the south side.

**5. Close public hearing.**

There being no further comment, the public hearing was closed.

**6. Call to Order**

Chairman Wermuth called the meeting to order in the Moline City Council Chamber.

**7. Approval of Minutes – October 28, 2015**

**Motion made by Commissioner Nelson; seconded by Commissioner Wetzel, to approve the minutes for October 28, 2015. Motion carried unanimously.**

**8. Consideration**

**PC 15-09**

**Motion made by Commissioner Kelly to approve a request from S.J. Russell, L.C. for a preliminary and final Planned Unit Development (PUD) Plan for senior living community to be located at 635 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue contingent upon incorporation of staff's recommendations 1 and 3 and also to correct the elevations, seconded by Commissioner Wetzel.**

Commissioner Nelson stated that if the stairs are not going to be used, they should be removed, noting that a fence is offensive. Brief discussion ensued among the Commissioners.

**Commissioner Kelly revised his Motion to add "either repair or remove the 4<sup>th</sup> Street stairway" after staff's recommendations. Motion carried unanimously.**

**PC 15-10**

**Motion made by Commissioner Wetzel to approve a request from S.J. Russell, L.C. for a Special Use Permit for a group development located at 635 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue, seconded by Commissioner McConaghy. Motion carried unanimously.**

**PC 15-11**

**Motion made by Commissioner Nelson to approve an application from Dan Wolff for a final Planned Unit Development Plan for a car wash to be located in the 6001 block of 44<sup>th</sup> Avenue, no second.**

**Motion made by Commissioner McConaghy to deny an application from Dan Wolff for a final Planned Unit Development Plan for a car wash to be located in the 6001 block of 44<sup>th</sup> Avenue, seconded by Commissioner Puck.**

Commissioner McConaghy states his recommendation is based upon the failure to meet the requirements of the approved PUD for Valley View Village. Commissioner Nelson inquired as to whether the Commission can obligate Menards to modify its current PUD. Brief discussion ensued amongst the Commissioners. Commissioner McConaghy inquires as to the Commissions desire to table the item.

**Commissioner McConaghy and Commissioner Puck withdraw their motions to deny.**

**Motion made by Commissioner Trevor to table an application from Dan Wolff for a final Planned Unit Development Plan for a car wash to be located in the 6001 block of 44<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Commissioner Crotty seconded.**

**9. Presentation on development activity (*Shawn Christ, Land Development Manager*)**

Shawn Christ gave an overview presentation of the land activity throughout 2015.

**10. Election of officers for 2016**

**Motion made by Commissioner Nelson to retain Chairman Wermuth and Vice-Chairman Fitzsimmons in their current seats, seconded by Commissioner Wetzel. Motion carried unanimously.**

**11. Other business**

No other business.

**12. Review upcoming meetings**

Mr. Christ stated that no business is scheduled for the December 9<sup>th</sup> meeting and suggests cancelling the meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:05 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Anamaria M. Vera, Administrative Secretary